Strategies and Tools for Enhancing Equity through PBIS

Kent McIntosh
Rhonda Nese
University of Oregon

Overview of Today’s Session

1. Discuss strategies and activities for coaches to build commitment to address equity
2. Describe a multi-component intervention approach for enhancing equity in school discipline through PBIS
3. Share details regarding a systematic alternative to out-of-school suspension

Handouts: http://www.pbis.org

Acknowledgements

PBIS Center Disproportionality Workgroup
- Aaron Barnes
- Alondra Canizal Delabra
- Yolanda Cargile
- Erin Chaparro
- Tai Collins
- Bert Eliason
- Erik Girvan
- Steve Goodman
- Clynita Grafenreed
- Ambra Green
- Rob Horner
- Don Kincaid
- Milaney Leveron
- Tim Lewis
- Kent McIntosh
- Kelsey Morris
- Rhonda Nese
- Vicki Nishioka
- Heidi von Ravensberg
- Jennifer Rose
- Therese Sandomierski
- Russ Skiba
- Kent Smith
- Keith Smolkowski

Getting going…

- Turn to a neighbor
  - What do you want to get out of this session?
Ground Rules

- Ask questions throughout
- Speak your truth
- Get comfortable with discomfort

Disproportionality in School Discipline (Losen et al., 2015)

http://civilrightsproject.ucla.edu/resources/projects/center-for-civil-rights-remedies/school-to-prison-folder/federal-reports/are-we-closing-the-school-discipline-gap
Two Types of Change
(Heifetz, Grashow, & Linksy, 2009)

- **Technical change**
  - Use of specific strategies, tools, interventions

- **Adaptive change**
  - Shifts in beliefs and attitudes

---

How to Make Lasting Change Happen in Schools (Guskey, 1986)

1. Change in Teaching Practices
2. Change in Student Outcomes
3. Change in Beliefs and Attitudes

---

How to Make Lasting Change Happen in Schools (Guskey, 1986)

1. Change in Teaching Practices
2. Change in Beliefs and Attitudes
3. Change in Student Outcomes
Status Questions: How much do you agree?

1. I am aware of my personal biases.
2. I am concerned about the consequences of bias in education.
3. I have effective strategies for reducing bias in educational decisions.

(Devine et al., 2012)

Some options for establishing commitment to equity

1. Show data: either theirs or national

   - Hit them over their heads with inequities
   - Cognitive dissonance: pattern that is not in line with our values as educators

Some options for establishing commitment to equity (Losen et al., 2015)

Disproportionality in School Discipline

http://civilrightsproject.ucla.edu/resources/projects-center-for-civil-rights-remedies-school-to-prison-folder/federal-reports/are-we-closing-the-school-discipline-gap
Risk Indices

Referral Risk Index
Major, 2013-14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Percentage (out of 100%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Native</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pacific</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Listed</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Multi-racial</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Black/White ODR Risk Ratio = 2.67

Some options for establishing commitment to equity

1. **Show data**: either theirs or national
   - Hit them over their heads with inequities
   - Cognitive dissonance: pattern that is not in line with our values as educators

- **Common Outcomes**:
  - Defensiveness
  - Challenging validity of the data
  - More blaming of students

Some options for establishing commitment to equity

2. **Cultural sensitivity training**
   - Discuss value of diversity
   - Introduce concept of White Privilege
   - Brief introductions to various cultures
Some options for establishing commitment to equity

2. Cultural sensitivity training
   - Discuss value of diversity
   - Introduce concept of White Privilege
   - Brief introductions to various cultures

   **Common Outcomes:**
   - Defensiveness
   - White people crying
   - Shift in attitudes for some?
   - No new strategies

(Lai et al., 2013; Pettigrew & Tropp, 2006)

1. Some options for establishing commitment to equity
   - **Show data:** either theirs or national
   - **Cultural sensitivity training**
   - **Impel an “aha” moment**

3. Some options for establishing commitment to equity
   - **Impel an “aha moment”**
   - Activity that addresses equity subtly
   - Problem-solve biggest challenges and hope
   - Tell a personal story of discrimination
Think-Pair Share

- Think back to a situation when you were unfairly stereotyped.
- What was the situation?
- How did you feel?

Some options for establishing commitment to equity

1. **Show data**: either theirs or national
2. **Cultural sensitivity training**
3. **Impel an “aha” moment**
4. **Introduce the concept of implicit bias and provide specific strategies**

Common Outcomes:
- Defensiveness?
- Shift in attitudes for some?
- No new strategies?

(Lai et al., 2013)

A 5-point Intervention Approach to Enhance Equity in School Discipline

http://www.pbis.org/school/equity-pbis
5-point Intervention Approach

1. Use engaging academic instruction to reduce the support gap (achievement gap)
2. Implement a behavior framework that is preventive, multi-tiered, and culturally responsive
3. Collect, use, and report disaggregated discipline data
4. Develop policies with accountability for disciplinary equity
5. Teach neutralizing routines for vulnerable decision points

http://www.pbis.org/school/equity-pbis

What do we mean by engaging academic instruction?

- Explicit instruction
- High rates of opportunities to respond
- Quality performance feedback
- Progress monitoring and data-based decision making

(Hattie, 2009)

Effects of Engaging Instruction on the Support Gap

2. Why start with a foundation of SWPBIS?

1. Proactive, instructional approach may prevent problem behavior and exposure to biased responses to problem behavior
2. Increasing positive student-teacher interactions may enhance relationships to prevent challenges
3. More objective referral and discipline procedures may reduce subjectivity and influence of cultural bias
4. Professional development may provide teachers with more instructional responses

(Tigard-Tualatin School District (Chaparro, Helton, & Sadler, in press)

(Greflund et al., 2014)
Effects of PBIS on Discipline Disproportionality

- Vincent et al., 2011
  - Statistically significantly lower Black-White ODR disproportionality in 72 schools implementing SWPBIS than in 81 schools not implementing SWPBIS
- Vincent et al., 2009
  - Decreases in ODRs seen across racial/ethnic groups in 69 schools implementing SWPBIS
- Scott, 2001
  - Larger decreases in suspensions for Black students when SWPBIS implemented
- McIntosh et al., 2014
  - Sustained decrease in suspensions over eight years of SWPBIS implementation in an Indigenous school

Which SWPBIS Features are Most Related to Equity? (Tobin & Vincent, 2011)

- Examined change in Black-White Relative Risk Index for suspensions in 46 schools
- Two key predictors of decreased disproportionality:
  - Regular use of data for decision making
  - Implementation of classroom SWPBIS systems

Which features predicted decreased disproportionality?

- Expected behaviors defined clearly
- Problem behaviors defined clearly
- Expected behaviors taught
- Expected behaviors acknowledged regularly
- Consistent consequences
- CW procedures consistent with SW systems
- Options exist for instruction
- Instruction/materials match student ability
- High rates of academic success
- Access to assistance and coaching
- Transitions are efficient and orderly

PBIS Cultural Responsiveness Companion (Leveron, Smith, & McIntosh, in prep)

- Aligned directly with SWPBIS Tiered Fidelity Inventory (TFI) Tier I Scale

http://www.pbisapps.org

https://www.pbisapps.org/Applications/Pages/PBIS-Assessment-Surveys.aspx#tfi
PBIS Cultural Responsiveness Companion

- Identifies 15 critical features of behavior support
  - Describes the big idea
  - Identifies cultural responsiveness concept
  - Provides non-examples, examples, activities, and resources

Recommended use…

1. Cultivate identity awareness
2. Complete the TFI
   - Identify areas of strength and priority
3. Refer to the CRC with the following options:
   - Build on TFI strengths
   - Address TFI priorities
   - Complete the entire CRC
4. Create and use an action plan

5 Ways to Make School Systems More Culturally Responsive
(Levenson, Smith, & McIntosh, in preparation)

1. Identity Awareness
   (staff/student/community)

Identity Awareness Activity
(self-reflection on values)

- This activity can be completed for staff to reflect on their personal values and how these values:
  - Change over time
  - Shape the school culture
  - May vary from those of others
  - How these differences could raise conflict
### Elements of Culture

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>My values growing up</th>
<th>My values now</th>
<th>What my school values</th>
<th>How my students and families might be different</th>
<th>How this difference may create conflict</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate personal space</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate voice level</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate dress</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appropriate response to insults</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Activity

- Review all 4 elements (rows) on your own
- Discuss your responses for one element

#### Discussion Points

- What has changed in your values over time?
- How might your values differ from those of your students?
- How do we identify what the school values are?
5 Ways to Make School Systems More **Culturally Responsive**
(Leverson, Smith, & McIntosh, in prep)

1. Identity Awareness  
   (staff/student/community)
2. Voice
3. **Supportive Environment**

---

**Student Input & Satisfaction Surveys**

---

5 Ways to Make School Systems More **Culturally Responsive**
(Leverson, Smith, & McIntosh, in prep)

1. Identity Awareness  
   (staff/student/community)
2. Voice
3. Supportive Environment

---

**Common PBIS Activity:**
**School-wide Expectations Matrix**

- Clarify what is expected for students
- Create consistency among staff
- Reduce miscommunication
- Make hidden curriculum visible
- Focus on prosocial behavior
5 Ways to Make School Systems More Culturally Responsive

1. **Identity Awareness**
   (staff/student/community)

2. **Voice**

3. **Supportive Environment**

4. **Situational Appropriateness**

---

### Culturally Responsive Adaptation: Personal Matrix

- **Aka “behavior dictionary”**
- **Tool to assist in “code-switching”**
- **The tweak:**
  - Take school expectations and...
    - Add differences at home
    - Add differences in community

---

### Expectations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Expectation</th>
<th>At SCHOOL it looks like...</th>
<th>At HOME it looks like...</th>
<th>In my NEIGHBORHOOD it looks like...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Be Safe</strong></td>
<td>• Keep hands and feet to self</td>
<td>• Tell an adult if there is a problem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Be Respectful</strong></td>
<td>• Treat others how you want to be treated</td>
<td>• Include others</td>
<td>• Listen to adults</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Be Responsible</strong></td>
<td>• Do my own work</td>
<td>• Personal best</td>
<td>• Follow directions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Expectation</td>
<td>Be Safe</td>
<td>Be Respectful</td>
<td>Be Responsible</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>---------------</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| At SCHOOL it looks like... | Keep hands and feet to self
Tell an adult if there is a problem | Treat others how you want to be treated
Include others
Listen to adults | Do my own work
Personal best
Follow directions
Clean up messes |
| At HOME it looks like... | Protect your friends and family
Don't talk back | Do exactly what adults tell you to do
Don't stand out
Don't bring shame | Help your family out first
Own your mistakes
Share credit for successes |
| In my NEIGHBORHOOD it looks like... | Stick up for your friends
Don't back down
Look the other way | Text back within 30 seconds
Be nice to friends' parents
Share food | Have each other's backs
Own your mistakes
Check in about what to do |

**Specific Expectation**

During ____________ at school, the expectation is for me to ________________.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>At home this looks like...</th>
<th>At school this looks like...</th>
<th>Questions I have about how it looks at school...</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Get a snack</td>
<td>Sit at my desk</td>
<td>How do I know I'm doing it right?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Go to the kitchen table</td>
<td>Use a volume level of &quot;1&quot;</td>
<td>What do I do when I'm done?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Follow the directions</td>
<td>Try every problem</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ask my brother if I need help</td>
<td>Work until the teacher says to stop</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Go play when done</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Specific Expectation: Example**

During independent seat work at school, the expectation is for me to work quietly by myself.

1. Identity Awareness (staff/student/community)
2. Voice
3. Supportive Environment
4. Situational Appropriateness
5. Data for Accountability

5 Ways to Make School Systems More Culturally Responsive

(Leverson, Smith, & Mcintosh, in prep)
3. Using disaggregated data to assess and address equity

- Disproportionality Data Guide

http://www.pbis.org/school/equity-pbis

4. Implement policies with accountability for equity

- Equity Policy Guide

http://www.pbis.org/school/equity-pbis

5. How can we reduce implicit bias in our decision making?

What is implicit bias?

- Unconscious, automatic
- Based on stereotypes
- We all have it (even those affected by it)
- Generally not an indication of our beliefs and values
- More likely to influence:
  - Snap decisions
  - Decisions that are ambiguous
A Unidimensional View of Bias

Racial Bias → Disproportionate Discipline

A Multidimensional View of Bias

Racial Bias → Disproportionate Discipline

Two Systems for Decision Making (Kahneman, 2011)

- **System 1: Fast Decisions**
  - Automatic, snap judgments
  - Intuitive, unconscious

- **System 2: Slow Decisions**
  - Deliberate decisions
  - Allows for conscious attention

Discussion

- Which decisions in schools are more likely to be snap judgments?
  - Correcting a student’s behavior
  - Sending a student to the office
  - Picking which student to call on
  - Deciding whether to call a student’s parent
  - Suspending a student from school
  - Grading students’ work
Bias in Google Web Searches (Sweeney, 2013)

- Likelihood of “Arrest Ad”
  - Black-sounding name: 60%
  - White-sounding name: 48%

Implicit Bias Research: *Racism is Real* (Brave New Films)

Think-Pair Share

- Reflect on what you’ve seen so far
- Turn to partner and share
  - One “aha”
  - One “ah…huh?”
Assumptions

- We all believe that a student’s color should not **fate** him or her to negative outcomes
- Discussing equity and race is **uncomfortable**
- Creating discomfort without providing **effective strategies** for equity is not productive
- In discussing equity and taking steps, we will make **mistakes**

What is a Vulnerable Decision Point (VDP)?

- A specific decision that is more vulnerable to effects of implicit bias
- Two parts:
  - Elements of the **situation**
  - The person’s **decision state** (internal state)

Situations: Options for Identifying VDPs

- Levels of specificity:
  1. All ODR/suspension decisions (general self-instruction routine)
  2. Identify VDPs through national data
  3. Use school or district data

**Using Discipline Data within SWPBIS to Identify and Address Disproportionality: A Guide for School Teams**

September 2014

http://www.pbis.org/school/equity-pbis
SWIS Drill Down (www.swis.org)

Add demographic group of interest as a filter (click to “Include in Dataset”).

Click each graph and compare to overall patterns.

National SWIS Data (2011-12)

3,026,367 ODRs
6,269 schools
47 states, plus DC

Office Referrals by Problem Behavior

Office Referrals by Location
Office Referrals by Time of Day

VDPs from national ODR data
- Subjective problem behavior
  - Defiance, Disrespect, Disruption
  - Major vs. minor
- Non-classroom areas
  - Hallways
- Classrooms
- Afternoons

Multidimensional View of Bias

Decision States:
Setting Events
- An event occurring before or with an antecedent that increases likelihood of a behavior
- Sets it up (slow trigger)
- Sometimes is present and sometimes is not
- Does not require one’s awareness
- Examples from students:
Decision States: Resource Depletion
(Girvan et al., 2014)

- As we become fatigued, our filters for appropriate behavior can be affected
- Effects of hunger (Gailliot et al., 2009)
- Decreases in willpower later in day
  - “The Morning Morality Effect” (Kouchaki & Smith, 2014)
  - Examples…

Resource Depletion in Action

- Outcomes of parole hearings (Danziger et al., 2011)

![Graph showing the proportion of favorable decisions over time with snack and lunch breaks for judges.]

Two-step Neutralizing Routine for Staff:

- When you see problem behavior, stop and ask yourself:
  1. Is this a VDP?
    - Situation
    - Decision state
  2. If so, use an agreed-upon alternative response

Neutralizing Routines for Reducing Effects of Implicit Bias

![Cloud diagram illustrating the process of identifying a vulnerable decision point and using an alternative response.]
What makes for a good neutralizing routine?

1. If-then statement
2. Brief
3. Clear steps
4. Doable
5. Interrupts the chain of events

Neutralizing Routine Examples

- If this is a VDP…,
  - “See me after class/at the next break”
  - am I acting in line with my values?
  - delay decision until I can think clearly
  - ask the student to reflect on their feelings/behavior
  - take two deep breaths
  - recognize my upset feelings and let them go
  - “I love you, but that behavior is not ok”
  - picture this student as a future doctor/lawyer
  - assume student’s best effort at getting needs met
  - model cool-down strategy
  - know that’s Rock Brain talking to me

Two-step Neutralizing Routine for Staff:

- Can also be used as precorrection
  1. Am I about to enter a VDP?
  2. What are my values?
  3. When I see problem behavior, I’ll use the alternative response

Opportunities to build fluency

“If you inadvertently assist the student to escalate, do not be concerned; you will get another chance to do it right the next time around.”

- Geoff Colvin
We just discussed one kind of discipline decision…

- The staff decision to send a student to the office (i.e., issue an ODR)
- What about the administrator’s decision?

What is the strongest predictor of disproportionality in school discipline?

- The school principal’s endorsement of exclusionary discipline and zero tolerance policies.

(Skiba, Trachok, Chung, & Baker, 2012)

Two-step Neutralizing Routine for Administrators: (Susan Barrett)

1. Don’t just do something, stand there!
   - Be sure you are ready to act in line with values
   - Get information from student and staff
   - Assess student-teacher relationship
2. Whenever possible, use an agreed-upon instructional response
   - Teaches missing skills
   - Connects student to school and staff

The Restorative Chat (Alton School District, Alton, IL)

1. Tell me what happened.
2. What you were thinking at the time?
3. What do you think about it now?
4. Who did this affect?
5. What do you need to do about it?
6. How can we make sure this doesn’t happen again?
7. What can I do to help you?
Professional Development

1. Use data to identify:
   - The extent of the problem
   - Vulnerable Decision Points (VDPs)
2. Teach and practice:
   - Implicit bias
   - VDPs
   - Neutralizing routines
3. Follow up:
   - Ongoing coaching
   - Monitor progress with data

School Example

Urban K-8 School

Risk Indices

Referral Risk Index
Major, 2013-14

- **Black/White ODR Risk Ratio = 2.67**

Drill Down: Phys. Aggression on Playground

Referral Risk Index (Ethnicity)

- **Black/White ODR Risk Ratio = 4.5**
The School PBIS Team’s Intervention

- ODRs and observations indicated differences in perceived basketball rules
- Team clarified rules for staff and students
  - Aka “code-switching”
- Additional teaching, practice, and acknowledgement
- Monitor with ODRs and Black-White RR

The School PBIS Team’s Intervention Outcomes

Black-White Risk Ratios

- Overall
  - 2013-14: 2.67
  - 2014-15 (Sept to Dec): 2.0
- Physical Aggression on Playground
  - 2013-14: 4.5
  - 2014-15 (Sept to Dec): can’t calculate (1 ODR)

Big Ideas

- Thinking about and discussing solutions is the first step
- Pick a neutralizing routine and try it out
- Use your data to assess and monitor
  - If you don’t have the data you need at hand, advocate for it
- This is hard work – but you know how to do it!
Piloting a Systematic Instructional Alternative to Out-of-School Suspension

Rhonda Nese, PhD
University of Oregon

What Do We Know?

- OSS/EP = ineffective for changing student behaviors
- Most often used for non-threatening problem behaviors
- Students miss:
  - Academic instructional time
  - Social skill building time
  - Being a part of a larger learning community

What Do We Know?

- Most frequently used with:
  - Students of color
  - Students from lower SES status
  - Students with disabilities
  - Students with academic deficits
- Harsh & disproportionate disciplined in schools for non-threatening behaviors linked to:
  - School failure
  - Drop-out
  - Substance use
  - Incarceration

What Can We Change?

- Keep students in class engaged in instruction
- Develop a system where fewer students are being sent to the office
- Provide an in-school instructional alternative for students who are sent out of class
- Help students and teachers improve their relationship by reconnect before returning to class
Preventative Strategies

- Establish classroom routines
- Positive acknowledgement of appropriate behaviors
- Differentiated instruction
- Re-teach of appropriate behavior
- Request change in behavior
- Invitation to self-correct
- Modify assignment
- Teacher proximity or visual prompt
- Mini-conference with student

Instructional Suspension Learning Alternative (ISLA)

- Start with school-wide staff training on classroom vs. office managed problem behaviors
- Clarify what to do for students who need breaks, but NOT referral worthy (set limits)
  - Peer teacher classroom
  - Academic assignment, 15 min limit
  - Peer training on ignoring
  - When to request additional support
- Clarify system for sending students to office
  - Need a referral
  - Academic assignment
  - Hall pass
  - Call home

Instructional Suspension Learning Alternative (ISLA)

- Step 1: Student-guided FBA
- Step 2: Skills Coaching & Academic Support
- Step 3: Restitution Plan (if necessary)
- Step 4: Restorative Chat
- Step 5: Restorative Chat Card
- Step 6: Classroom Reentry
Student-guided FBA

6 Questions
- What was the situation and what happened?
- Why did you do that?
- How did it make you feel?
- How do you think that affected others?
- What would’ve been a better response?
- What can you do the next time it happens?
  - Let’s practice that!

Skills Coaching

1. Identify the Appropriate Skill
2. Teach and Model
3. Practice with Guided Support
4. Performance Feedback
5. Communication with Staff Members

**Academic support is a great tool for de-escalation if a student is not ready for skills coaching**

Restitution Plan (if necessary)

- Part of skills coaching
- If a student caused minor destruction (e.g. food fight in the cafeteria, ripping down a poster, knocking over a trash can),
  - Help the student brainstorm ideas that would repair the damage and make amends with anyone affected (e.g. custodial staff).

**Any restitution activity must be logically tied to correcting the harm that was originally caused.**

Restorative Chat

- Conversation between teacher and student before student reenters the classroom.
- Allows for reparation of relationship and clarity of behavior correction.
- Is guided and rehearsed before going live.
- Adult is present with student while they engage in chat.

**Call teacher before escorting student back to class.**
Restorative Chat Card

Dear __________,
I am sorry for ______________________
In ISLA, I learned____________________________
Therefore, I will work on ______________________
Here is how I’m going to try and prevent the problem from happening again: ______________
In order for me to be successful, here is the support I need from you: ______________________
I appreciate the opportunity to correct my behavior.
Thank you, _____________

Teacher Response

- Allow the student to engage in the restorative chat with you.
- If they do this, allow them back into the classroom without punishment, retribution, or a grudge.
- Allow the student to rejoin the class activity without a further conversation about it, trust that the point has been driven home.

Goals of ISLA

- A reduction in OSS
- A reduction in the amount of time spent out of class
- A reduction in administrative time dedicated to low-level pb
- A more systematic process for getting students back to class, with learned skills
- A system that students and staff feel is fair, equitable, and feasible

Think-Pair Share and Steps Forward

- Turn to partner and share:
  - One aha
  - One ah…huh?
  - One next step
References


References


References


